


clearly and explicitly teaches a catalyst that may include aluminum chloride, aluminum bromide or mixtures thereof, which may incorporate some other metal halides (col. 3, lines 26-29). Accordingly, no catalyst consisting of aluminum fluoride as claimed is taught or suggested by Miller et al., even among the catalysts of Miller et al., but at most aluminum fluoride is disclosed as an optional carrier for the specifically listed catalysts of Miller et al.

Applicants further point out that in the Office Action dated July 30, 2002, it is alleged that it is irrelevant that Miller et al. does not identify aluminum fluoride as catalytically active. However, Applicants respectfully submit that such allegation is untenable as the claimed invention is clearly concerned with aluminum fluoride as a catalyst. Thus, since the Miller et al. reference does not teach or suggest aluminum fluoride as catalytically active, but only as an optional carrier as noted above, the reference clearly cannot be considered to teach or suggest the claimed invention. It is also alleged in the Office Action that the claimed invention does not exclude the presence of other catalytic materials such as aluminum chloride. Applicants respectfully submit that this allegation is moot since the claimed invention, as noted above, is concerned with a catalyst consisting of aluminum fluoride. Therefore, in that the cited reference is unable to teach or suggest each and every feature as claimed, and since it is through the catalyst consisting of aluminum fluoride that the claimed invention is able to surprisingly and unexpectedly address the technical problem of obtaining a substantially quantitative conversion of CFC-113 to CFC-113a, Applicants urge that the claimed invention should be considered patentable in view of the prior art.

In view of the remarks above, Applicants submit that this application is in condition for allowance and request favorable action thereon.

In the event this paper is not considered to be timely filed, Applicants hereby petition for an appropriate extension of time. The fee for this extension may be charged to our Deposit Account No. 01-2300. The Commissioner is hereby authorized to charge any fee deficiency or credit any overpayment associated with this communication to Deposit Account No. 01-2300, referencing Attorney Docket No. 108910-00052.

Respectfully submitted,

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Hans J. Crosby  
Registration No. 44,634

**Customer No. 004372**  
ARENT FOX KINTNER PLOTKIN & KAHN, PLLC  
1050 Connecticut Avenue, N.W., Suite 400  
Washington, D.C. 20036-5339  
Tel: (202) 857-6000; Fax: (202) 638-4810  
HJC/ccd